ICONOGRAFIA MUSICAL

Autores de Países Ibero-Americanos e Caraíbas

Núcleo de Iconografia Musical (NIM)

CENTRO DE ESTUDOS DE SOCIOLOGIA E ESTÉTICA MUSICAL (CESEM)
FCSH - UNIVERSIDADE NOVA DE LISBOA

EDITOR

Luzia Rocha

COLABORAÇÕES

Elena Le Barbier, Universidad de Oviedo, Espanha
Isabel Porto Nogueira, Universidade Federal de Rio Grande do Sul, Brasil
Luís Sousa, IEM/FCSH-Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal
Luzia Rocha, CESEM/FCSH-Universidade Nova de Lisboa e Universidade Lusíada, Portugal
María Carolina Rodríguez Tabata, Universidad Central de Venezuela, Venezuela
Mauricio Molina, Conservatorio de Girona, Espanha
Ruth Piquer Sanclemente e Alfredo Piquer Garzón, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Espanha
Sónia Silva Duarte, CESEM/FCSH-Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal
Verónica Elvira Fernández Díaz, Universidad de las Artes de Camagüey, Cuba

Núcleo de Iconografia Musical (NIM): Ana Dias, Luís Correia de Sousa, Luzia Rocha(Coord.), Sónia Silva Duarte.

CESEM, FCSH - Universidade Nova de Lisboa

LS.B. N.:978-989-20-5491-9

Capa: Músico mestiço, painel de azulejos da primeira metade do século XVIII, *Quinta das Mil Flores*, Embaixada do Brasil em Lisboa, Portugal

Prefácio

Mário Vieira de Carvalho

"Fazer música" é realizá-la, quer na base duma tradição oral, improvisadamente, quer na base de um texto previamente notado ou "composto". Por isso, "fazer música" não existe sem eventos sonoros gerados por ação humana. É presença e comunicação: presença do som e da ação humana que lhe dá origem, ou que lhe é inerente como escuta ou como elemento de um processo sociocomunicativo em sentido mais lato.

"Fazer música" contempla o todo holístico em que ela ocorre: quem a toca; quem a ouve ou quem com ela interage de alguma outra maneira, ainda que imóvel e em silêncio; e também o contexto cultural, histórico-social. A comunicação está sempre vinculada a uma situação social concreta, a qual, no limite, pode ser a da comunicação do músico somente consigo próprio.

A iconografia musical interpreta as imagens que captam ou têm alguma relação com a música — mormente com o ato de fazer música. Antes da era da reprodutibilidade técnica, que permitiu a reprodução fonográfica e de imagens em movimento e, mais tarde, de imagens sonoras em movimento, não havia senão testemunhos mudos das culturas musicais do passado. Nas tradições de música notada, só sobrevivia do gesto sonoro a sua tentativa de representativa simbólica. Nas outras tradições, as mais antigas e predominantes, nem isso: apenas o silêncio enigmático das imagens; a representação de diferentes formas, situações e artefactos de uma comunição musical cuja substância sonora se perdeu para sempre.

Mas, precisamente porque a música é o todo holístico em que ela ocorre e não apenas som – isto é, uma rede de relações de interação que não se confina ao momento performativo, antes incorpora instituições e processos sociais complexos de "musicar" (musicking) no sentido lato cunhado por Christopher Small (envolvendo os sistemas de produção, mediação, receção e múltiplos vetores contextuais) –, as imagens que nos chegam do ato de fazer música constituem, na sua mudez, um manancial de informação extraordinariamente eloquente. Porventura ainda mais eloquente – tratando-se de música do passado remoto – do que a informação fornecida pela própria notação. Não raro, é a imagem do "fazer música", e não tanto a notação dela, que verdadeiramente nos abre os horizontes hermenêuticos da sua reconstrução a um tempo sonora e social.

Por outro lado, as representações de elementos musicais não podem desligar-se da iconografia em geral: elas são parte de um património de imagens tão antigo como as próprias culturas

humanas. As suas componentes materiais e simbólicas, os seus suportes, as suas formas de circulação ou receção – privilegiando ora o "valor de culto", ora o "valor de exposição", ora o "valor de uso", ora o "valor de troca" – transformam-nas, por sua vez, enquanto imagens, em protagonistas de sistemas de comunicação simbólica que importa investigar na sua função, na sua genealogia ou nas suas fontes (à maneira exaustiva de Aby Warburg), ou nas suas relações com contextos, tradições, processos interculturais, dinâmicas políticas ou de poder, questões de género e, é claro, também na sua "linguagem estética" (para citar apenas exemplos de um leque dir-se-ia inesgotável de possibilidades oferecidas à nossa interpelação).

Os ensaios reunidos nesta publicação são bem demonstrativos dessas múltiplas linhas de pesquisa de iconografia musical que iluminam diferentes estratégias, quer da comunicação musical, quer da sua representação em imagem, quer dos projetos artísticos ou estéticos envolvidos nos objetos analisados.

Elena Le Barbier Ramos e Mauricio Molina abordam a iconografia musical medieval. Elena Ramos investiga as fontes literárias - designadamente bíblicas, entre outras - em que se baseiam os artistas medievais na sua iconografia musical, e estuda por seu turno esses testemunhos como fontes para uma melhor compreensão do papel da música na sociedade medieval. Molina analisa a complexa questão da imagem da mulher executante na Idade Média, a sua contraditória figura, suscitando respeito e consideração pelas suas destrezas e, simultaneamente, estigmatização e condenação como fonte de "pecado", por desafiar os estereótipos da ordem social - contradição essa em certa medida resolvida pela tentativa de construção duma imagem "mais limpa" que assegurasse a sua mobilidade social. Também Isabel Porto Nogueira se ocupa extensivamente das questões de género, tomando por objeto fotografias de mulheres intérpretes ou intérpretes/compositoras em programas da década de 1940 e 1950, e descodificando-as na perspetiva da construção da identidade face a um mundo intelectual e artístico então ainda predominantemente masculino. O mesmo tópico está ainda presente no ensaio de Luzia Rocha, incidindo sobre os azulejos de figura avulsa com motivos musicais, presentes em coleções portuguesas, e onde também são abordados outros detalhes musicais e a dimensão organológica. Luís Manuel Correia de Sousa estuda as gravuras de uma obra de referência do Renascimento - Hypnerotomachie Poliphili, de Fransciscus Columna - enquadrando-a na matriz cultural e estético-ideológica da época como revisitação da cultura da Antiguidade. María Carolina Rodríguez Tabata investiga a noção e aplicação da iconografia como método de investigação em textos historiográficos venezuelanos que recorrem à relação entre artes plásticas e música ao abordar a atividade musical na época colonial (séculos XVI-XVIII) - época em que se cria uma cultura de mestiçagem em resultado da confluência "do espanhol, do aborígene e do africano". Alfredo Piquer Garzón e Ruth Piquer Sanclemente trabalham sobre a obra litográfica de Henri Fantin-Latour, mostrando a sua importância, quer no contexto das relações entre artistas plásticos e músicos na segunda metade do século XIX, quer na renovação dos ideais estéticos.

Finalmente, Verónica Elvira Fernández Díaz aborda a iconografia musical como testemunho sociocultural de uma região específica de Cuba, no quadro de um projeto de salvaguarda do património musical regional que pressupõe o contributo de várias disciplinas musicológicas. Trata-se, pois, de um conjunto de ensaios muito representativo de diversas tendências da iconografia musical, onde se entrecruzam a história, a sociologia, a estética, e donde também não está ausente uma teoria crítica da sociedade.

Mário Vieira de Carvalho

Janeiro de 2015

ICONOGRAFIA MUSICAL

Autores de Países Ibero-Americanos e Caraíbas

ÍNDICE

Elena Le Barbier Ramos: De lo Literario a lo Visual: Función de la Música en la Edad Media [7-26]

Isabel Porto Nogueira: A Construção das divas: uma análise iconográfica de fotografias de mulheres intérpretes em programas de concerto [27-43]

Luís Correia de Sousa: A Evocação da Música e reinvenção da Antiguidade em "O Sonho de Poliphili" [44-68]

Luzia Aurora Rocha: Representações de Música em Azulejos de Figura Avulsa: prácticas musicais plasmadas em pequenos suportes [69-89]

María **C**arolina **R**odríguez **T**abata: La Iconografía Musical en la Historiografía Musical Venezolana (Período Colonial) [90-109]

Mauricio **M**olina: "Alleviators of Sadness and Tedium": Constructing a Socially Acceptable Image for the Medieval Female Performer. [110-134]

Ruth Piquer Sanclemente & Alfredo Piquer Garzón: Litografía y Música: Henri Fanton Latour [135-155]

Sónia **S**ilva **D**uarte: *E em Portugal ha taes, tam grandes, e naturaes:* imagens de música nas tábuas do pintor régio Gregório Lopes [156-179]

Verónica Elvira Fernández Díaz: Elementos para el estudio de la iconografía musical en el Puerto Príncipe del siglo XIX [180-207]

"Alleviators of Sadness and Tedium": Constructing a Socially Acceptable Image for the Medieval Female Performer

por

Mauricio Molina

Director of the International Course on Medieval Music Performance of Besalú, España maurus4@gmail.com

La imagen de la intérprete musical medieval se nos presenta como una construcción de gran complejidad. Mientras que por un lado esta mujer disfrutaba de una gran popularidad—debido a su destreza musical, conocimiento de repertorio y energéticas interpretaciones—, por otra parte se la consideraba un personaje que actuaba en contra de preceptos de movilidad social e intelectualidad asignados por la cultura patriarcal a la que pertenecía. En la fuentes medievales encontramos que esta imagen contradictoria era desambiguada a través de una representación consciente de la intérprete como una persona con poca destreza musical que se insinuaba sexualmente a los hombres. Sin embargo, ciertas representaciones contemporáneas sugieren además que la estigmatización sufrida por la intérprete musical era contrarrestada a través de la presentación de una imagen más "pura" que le permitía un cierto grado de actividad social.

Palabras-Claves Iconografia Musical Medieval, Juglar, Juglar (fem.), práctica musical medieval; Instrumentos Musicales de Percusión, Danza Medieval.

The image of the medieval female performer is a complex one. On the one hand she was popular and highly appreciated for her musical dexterity, knowledge of repertoire, and lively performances, but on the other she was perceived as being at odds with social precepts. Her sin was simple: she challenged certain stereotypes of social mobility and intellectuality assigned to women by a male-dominated culture. This contradictory image was thereby disambiguated through the conscious portrayal of the female performer as both an unskilled musician and sexually available woman with lewed intentions. At the same time, to counteract this stigmatization a "neater" image also seemed to have been constructed to ensure the performers' mobility in society.

Keywords: Medieval Musical Iconography, Jongleurs, Jongleresse, Medieval Performance Practice, Medieval Percussion Instruments, Medieval Dance.

The prominent presence of professional female singers, dancers, and instrumentalists in the society of the Middle Ages is well recorded in art (1). Their customary performance activity in secular and ecclesiastical courts is also revealed by contemporary payment records, descriptions of performances in secular literature, and clerical writings such as sermons and condemnations. Moreover, the long periods of time that some of these female performers spent at various courts and the enthusiastic description of their skills in recommendation letters written by and for important secular or ecclesiastical patrons indicate the degree of approval and admiration that some of these entertainers enjoyed. Among many examples are those of the jongleresse Isabel, 'the songstress' who was recommended by the Aragonese King Pedro IV in 1385 to the kings of Navarre, Castile, and France; and of a songstress-dancer named Argentina who was recommended by Joan I of Aragon (1350-1396) to his sister Leonor of Castile (2).

But despite their musical prowess and well-regarded entertaining aptitudes, these women also were stigmatized because their behavior was seen as breaking the stereotypes imposed on them by a male-dominated culture. Scholars agree that since these entertainers did not appear to be under the control of a male figure (both in or outside of the performance context) in principle, they were perceived as rejecting conventional strictures that urged females to maintain established roles such as those of housewives or pious women (3). Their pursuit of monetary remuneration — a feature that associated women with prostitutes [1] [2] — and their physical presentation before a male audience (4) magnified the perception of irregular behaviour. The use of dancing, contortions, or any other type of lively or energetic movement of the body such as the playing of percussion instruments further worsened their respectability (5). Examples of the anxiety created by this type of physical performance are abundant in clerical writings such as sermons and condemnations (6). A good example, especially poignant for its biblical reference, is found in a passage of the twelfth-century *Summa de sacramentis* written by Peter the Chanter where it is explained that "Some [jongleurs] earn a living through the immoral and obscene use of their bodies, in this way deforming the image of God" (7).

As we can see, medieval society perceived the female performer in an ambiguous fashion. While her musical skills, specialized performances, and physical presentation earned her a good reputation before captivated audiences, at the same time these features helped distin-

guish her as being defiant against the established system. This ambivalent view in which the charming female entertainer was considered to be at odds with the cultural precepts of the period seem to have generated, especially among clerical authorities, the need to clarify her social image through the principles of contemporaneous patriarchal control [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9]. Medieval literature reveals that in this process of disambiguation a devalued image was created following two different constructs: 1) female performers were considered to have inferior musical knowledge and skills than those possessed by male musicians; and 2) female performers exhibited lewd intentions and were sexually available. The entangling of these two concepts resulted in their final identification as sexually accessible women with limited musical skills not only among medieval contemporaries, but also modern historians (8). It is in this context that we should consider the late twelfth-century representation of the Moabite woman playing an adufe (square frame drum) from one of the Pamplona Bibles (Numbers 25:1-2) (9) (fig. 1) and the fourteenth-century depiction of Salome dancing and playing a timbre (tambourine with jingles) from the Retaule dels Sants Joans (fig. 2). In these cases the impious females mentioned in the Bible have been depicted as attractive but dangerous performers who were undoubtedly based on actual contemporaneous entertainers [1].



Caption: Fig. 1: The encounter between the Jewish princes and the Moabite women. Pamplona Bible, circa 1197. Amiens, Bibliothèques d'Amiens Métropole. Ms Lat. 108 fol. 64v



Caption: Fig. 2: Salome dancing before Herod and Herodias. Master of Santa Coloma de Queralt, Detail from the Altarpiece Retaule dels Sants Joans, c. 1379. MB 515/507. Picture by Calveras/Mérida/Sagristà.

And, while this was the general image ascribed to these performers during the Middle Ages at least in literature and art, some particular Iberian depictions of female musicians suggest that at least in some cases and in some places there was an attempt to challenge this stigmatization by constructing a "cleaner and more positive image" of these entertainers. These visual sources analyzed in conjunction with written records suggest that this "neater" image was carefully constructed with the use of a restrained presentation of the body during performance that not only projected decorum, but that also placed the female entertainer within acceptable patriarchal social limits.

Notably, anthropological and ethnomusicological research reveals that the hesitation about the social mobility of female performers, their devaluation according to patriarchal constructs, and the need of these entertainers to create a "positive" image before an audience is not exclusive to medieval Christian culture. Studies reveal that in some modern conservative European and Mediterranean patriarchal societies similar types of female performers also

have to deal with comparable constrictions by molding a figure acceptable to the public eye [10] [11] [12] [5]. An observation of these modern cases in juxtaposition with the medieval data offer us the possibility of making parallels between the type of stigmatization suffered by the medieval entertainers and their modern counterpart, and the steps taken by both in their attempt to navigate their societies through the improvement of their image. This multidisciplinary approach promises to be advantageous since it might help complement our findings, thus guiding us towards a deeper understanding of medieval performers.

The purpose of this article is to explore: 1) how the medieval female performer was actually perceived by her contemporaries; 2) how negative elements were consciously enforced in the molding of her image; and 3) how physical, musical, and social elements might have been utilized by the performers and their own society to counteract their bad reputation and stigmatization. This inquiry, which pays close attention to the performers' musical dexterity and the audience's admiration of their performances, will hopefully help to challenge the customary negative image created by medieval conservative writers, and perpetuated by modern historiography [13] [5], that limits the view of these entertainers as mere prostitutes with little musical ability (10).

I. Patriarchal Control and the Minimization of the Female Musician

We discern from different medieval sources that female musicians were able to captivate their audience by displaying great musical dexterity in their performances. Admiration for their prowess was probably such that writers and artists actually went to pains to ascribe to these women performing skills considered during the time as features of outstanding music making. Furthermore, besides being portrayed as remarkable entertainers, these women were also praised for their knowledge about the art of music and for their role as keepers and transmitters of repertoire [1].

But, despite their great musical skills, social and cultural conventions made medieval society feel uneasy about these performers: women were expected to fit into the roles of the married mother or the woman of faith, and to limit themselves to the social spaces reserved to them [4] [14] [5] [7] [9] [15]. But, by performing music in public women entered social spaces

usually reserved for males, thus expressing independent behavior (11). Furthermore, in medieval culture the masters of music were usually men with ecclesiastical education and certain performing spaces, both real as well as ideal, were seen as belonging to them [15]. Given this context, it is therefore not surprising that one of the ways in which these women were put back "into their proper place" was by minimizing their musical dexterity, implying their lower status compared to the knowledgeable and more musically talented men.

A great example of the conflicting attitudes between the admiration of the musical dexterity of female performers and the conservative attitudes about their performance in a physical and intellectual space reserved for men can be found in the thirteenth-century *Libro de Apolo-nio*. In stanza 179 we find described how Luciana, daughter of King Architrastes, performs on the fiddle with great dexterity (12):

[She performed] a *laude* like no other heard before, / [and] played beautiful melodies and beautiful cadential lines, / sometimes singing [over the instrument] with great intention; / she played on the fiddle correctly performed notes (*puntos ortados*), / [performing them rhetorically] similar to the sound of affirmative words (13).

As we can see, the author constructs the fiddler's image as a great performer by enumerating the following practical elements: beautiful playing, knowledge of appropriate repertoire, improvisation of cadences, and rhetorical performance, all features recorded in contemporaneous music treatises as elements of admirable music making (14). Furthermore, *ortado*, which I translate as "correctly performed", has been interpreted by some as making reference to the science of music [16] [17] [15]. Thus, Luciana, as someone who knows the "correct" laws of composition and the art of performing, is presented as a real music master because of her understanding (*entendimiento*) of this art.

Thus, Luciana's musical attributes and dexterous performance are presented to the reader to project the figure of an outstanding performer. Moreover, the author also utilizes the praising voice of the audience to represent the impact that such musical skills had in a willing public, as witnessed in the following lines: "People of all different statuses, praised her saying: / how

well this woman plays the fiddle! / They all thought that they were contemplating a great deed. / Others complimented her in even better ways (15)".

But, the praises of her dexterity are minimized in the following lines. In stanza 183 the hero Apolonio expresses his disapproval of Luciana's performance by saying to the king: "Your daughter understands a good amount, / she has started well and she is knowledgeable, / but, she should not think that she is yet a master. / If she wants to sing, she is [by me] defeated (16)". Thereafter, Apolonio demonstrates his own skills, overshadowing the prowess of the female fiddler.

In this passage from the *Libro de Apolonio*, any type of ambivalence about male-female roles in medieval society created by Luciana's dexterous and powerful performance and her intrusion in the space reserved to men is resolved by the author's construction of the superiority of the male character along conventional gender and power lines [15]. This definition of roles is further enhanced by her father's petition to Apolonio to become her master in stanza 193: "Daughter! said the king, to him [Apolonio] I have commanded to become your teacher, and he has agreed (17)".

As we can see, the skillful and musically knowledgeable Luciana is put in her "proper" place: under the control of men (18). In the above-mentioned passage from the *Libro de Apolonio* male anxiety created by a virtuoso or master female musician intruding in a male's space called for this type of jurisdiction. In the text, patriarchal control is expressed through Apolonio's spiteful attitude towards Luciana's magnificent performance and subsequent designation of his role as her master, a position created by the king, her own father.

II. Patriarchal Control and the Stigmatization of Virtuoso Performers as Sirens and Prostitutes

Besides "competing" with male expertise and for performance space, female performers also defy other patriarchal stereotypes. Scholars agree that the apprehensive attitude against female performers was primarily connected to their sexual status: during the Middle Ages women who were not identified as being under the control of a husband, master, or other male figure were dangerously perceived as sexually available [14]. In their position as performers, these

women refuse to adhere to conventional strictures that urged females to maintain traditional postures as housewives. Thus, their independent behavior granted them a status of temptresses, living personifications of *luxuria* [4] [7] [8] [9]. These women were further associated with prostitutes because, as professionals, they performed for monetary remuneration [14] [9] [2].

The wrong connotation of the involvement of money in the performers' activity is documented in the *Siete Partidas*, law codes compiled by Alfonso X of Castile (1252-1284). In Partida 7.6.4 professional performers in general are criticized for their monetary interest:

Thus, jongleurs and mimes, and masked performers who go around towns singing or entertaining with games for a price, [lose their honor because] they act in despicable ways thanks to the money that it is given to them. But, those who play instruments or sing for their own entertainment or of their friends or give pleasure to kings or other lords [without remuneration] should not lose their honor and respectability (19).

As far as we can gather from the sources cited, the challenge of female performers to social structure had great religious, moral, and public implications. Therefore, as we have seen above, an attempt to control these women by men and church was seen as being completely "justified". The way to gain control was to stigmatize and demonize these performers as prostitutes, defining them clearly under concepts of gender relations and social behavior. Thus, with this constructed figure of the female entertainer any type of ambivalence about ritual identities was mitigated (20). Once this immoral image was constructed, her dexterous performance could be completely outcast from secular life since it endangered model customs of Christian society.

The following text taken from the late fourteenth-century *Tractatulus de differentiis et gradibus cantorum* of Arnulf of St Ghislain perfectly exemplifies how the virtuoso performance practice of female musicians, in fact admired by the author, is demonized and outcast from public space due to the writers' negative view of the performers. The author starts by commenting on the incredible skills of some female singers carefully describing elements of their musical practice and the outstanding and angelic effect of their performance. Nonetheless, after his praise, the

author resolves his hesitation about these performers by putting them, with the use of religious symbolism and colorful classical images, in their proper place as dangerous women:

... of the favoured female sex [sexus feminei]—which is so much the more precious the more it is rare; when it freely divides tones into semitones with a sweet-sounding throat, and divides semitones into indivisible microtones [athomos], it enjoys itself [lascivit] with an indescribable melody that you would rather deem angelic than human. So it is that these women—goddesses, or indeed rather earthly Sirens—enchant [incarminant] the bewitched ears [incantatas aures] of their listeners and they steal away their hearts, which are for the most part lulled [sopora] by this kind of intoxication [ebrietate], in secret theft, and having snatched them and made them subject to their will, they then enslave them and lead them, shipwrecked by the beauty, alas!, of their prison, into an earthly Charybdis in which no kind of redemption or ransom [nullum redemptionis genus vel precium] is available (21).

As in the case of the author of the *Libro de Apolonio*, Arnulf utilizes precise technical descriptions about their musical skills, validating their performance as a high quality affair. But, as we can see, after deeming their performance skillful, the writer immediately warns his reader against the fascinating and intoxicating power of this art, regarded by him as ultimately having devastating consequences. Arnulf's change in tone one more time reflects the hesitation and anxiety that is created by the powerful performance of women and the need to conform these dexterous musicians into the system of male control.

The view of the performance of female musicians as a musically skillful but dangerous and intoxicating affair can be also found in art. A good example can be seen in the twelfth-century *Hortus Deliciarum* of Herrad of Landsberg in which three female performers—a singer, a flute player and a harpist—depicted with a naturalism that conveys their enticing performance, personify sirens who try to lure a group of sailors to their death (22) (fig. 3). An interesting element that separated this representation from other depictions of sirens in the Middle Ages is that while these mythical figures are commonly represented as hybrid monsters—half birds and half women—with naked torsos [18] [19] [20] (23), in the *Hortus Deliciarum* they are depicted as beautiful and expressive performers completely dressed. Here, even though their wings are clearly displayed, their bird feet can hardly be distinguished under their garments.

Furthermore, different from other representations of lustful female entertainers who wear their long hair down, the sirens wear headdresses in the manner of women who follow the norms of the appropriate dress code of the period [21] [22]. Therefore, they appear to be hiding their malicious intentions and monstrous bodies behind a musically satisfying performance and the innocent habits of accepted contemporary women.



Caption: Fig. 3: Sirens luring sailors. In Hortus Deliciarum, twelfth century, plate LVII.

III. Lascivious Performers but Keepers and Transmitters of Repertoire

We arrive to one final example from the fourteenth-century *Libro de buen amor* of the Spanish cleric Juan Ruiz, a poetic work considered by scholars to be an excellent record of contemporary Castilian customs (24). In this work we find some of the most detailed descriptions about musical instruments, performance practice, and female performers written in the Middle Ages. In stanzas 470-471 the author portrays the performance of a songstress-dancer-frame drummer described as a *cantadera* (songstress):

After the *cantadera* sings the first song, her feet always move and she strikes the *pandero*. For weaver and *cantadera* never stop moving their feet, at the loom and at the dance they always move their fingers; even if a shameless woman is offered a price worthy of ten times the city of Toledo, she would not give up indulging in shameless cravings (25).

One of the most interesting things about the entertainer as described by the author is her simultaneous use of different performance means: song, dance, and playing of a musical instrument. The text is only illustrative and does not particularly praise the woman, except perhaps, by clearly describing her dexterity utilizing three different performance mediums at the same time. As can be deduced from the last two lines, and other more hidden elements, the figure of the *cantadera* is used to enhance the erotic character of the passage by playing on her stigmatized condition of a sexually available woman [1]. In any case the main notorious feature of this entertainer is her energetic physical performance. The implied frontal view of her body with the constant back and forth movement of her feet and fingers are related by the author to those of the weaver probably to capture in the mind of the reader an image of constant and rhythmic body drive. As it can be deduced from the whole context, this physical movement was considered to oppose female decorum.

IV. Constructing a Socially Acceptable Entertainer in Medieval and Modern Culture

Despite the stigmatization and social ambivalence, the common hiring of female performers in different courts tells us that the admiration for their musical accomplishments was stronger than their prohibition [23] [24] [25] [5]. A few examples will suffice here: In 1239 Louise IX paid a considerable amount to a songstress named Mélanz; in 1303 the Aragonese king Jaime II paid two male and two female performers (dos juglars e dues juglaresses francesses) for his entertainment; in 1338 three songstresses (chanteresses) were paid by Margarite of France; and for ten years (between 1370-80) Phillipe le Hardi hired ménestrels de bouche, chanteresses. Similarly, in 1374 songstresses and dancers were paid to perform for the Duke of Berri; in 1377 the Duchess of Burgundy hired Aiglantine of Tournay, a reputed singer; and during the first quarter of the fifteenth century a certain Spanish songstress-dancer named Graciosa Alegre worked for both Alfonso V of Aragon and Isabel of France.

The question is, if these women were so stigmatized and outcast, how did they manage to break cultural precepts and perform freely for important secular patrons? Did they and/or their society remodel their status to allow them to function within acceptable limits? Perhaps an examination of how some modern female performers enjoy a certain degree of freedom in conservative patriarchal societies can give us some clues about how their medieval counterparts might have achieved social mobility.

As in the case of medieval female performers, twentieth-century Muslim women entertainers also were also strongly criticized by conservative members of the community. Nonetheless singers and actresses like Umm Kulthoum, Munira al-Mahdiyya, Fathiyya Ahmad, and Ashmahan became famous and accepted in the Muslim world because of their great talents and the way they molded their public image [10]. For example, Umm Kuthoum, considered the greatest diva of the Arabic world, always took care to project the image of a conservative respectable woman devoid of sexual undertones. This was achieved, especially when she was young, by dressing conservatively with sober taste—wearing modestly cut long dresses with long sleeves—and by keeping her head and shoulders covered [10] (fig. 4).



Caption: Fig. 4: Omm Kulthoum in her early days in Cairo, c. 1925. Published in Radio Misriyya, 25 of June 1938.

Umm Kulthoum also made a conscious effort to ensure that her performances were focused on her great music dexterity avoiding the projection of any sensuality. In addition, she performed traditional religious music, and secular pieces composed for her by some of the most famous poets of her time, men with a good status in society [10]. Thus, by constructing the desexualized female image of a gifted singer who performed spiritually edifying music and also serving as a voice for admired male poets, Umm Kulthoum gained a patronage and protection that granted her a type of mobility rarely available to a woman in her society.

Similarly, modern Muslim Rom female performers from the Balkans also have to find different ways to legitimize their performance and gain social acceptance. The principal way to mitigate their status as sexually available women is by marrying a musician [12]. By getting married the female performer completely changes her image in society since a husband is seen as the protector of her honor. In the case of unmarried women, the protective role of a husband also can be provided by her father or a brother. For this reason it is common that female performers today perform with men to whom they are connected by blood [12].

Medieval payment records and art suggest that medieval female entertainers— looking to gain social acceptance—used methods similar to the ones employed by their modern sisters. Medieval performers, as in the case of the Muslim entertainers studied above, had to negotiate and construct their image in relation to their patrons and their social and performance environment: in public, women had to adjust to male domination to find an acceptable placement in society. As in the case of the Rom women, one of their approaches was probably to marry male musicians and perform with them to mitigate their image as sexually available women. This is suggested by records that document women performing with their husbands. One of the most cited examples is the case of the soldadera Guilelma Monja who was married to the Occitan troubadour-jongleur Gaucelm Faidit (fl. 1180-1216) and who performed with him throughout the courts of Europe [26] [27] [28]. Other examples can be found in thirteenth- and fourteenth-century payment records from the Crown of Aragon. In them we find evidence of the female performers Sancha and her husband Fernando, María and her husband Johannot, another Sancha and her Portuguese husband Pedro, and of the French songstress-dancer Argentina who traveled with her husband Jean of Bruges. Also, among others, we learn about Catherine, the *chanteresse* married to the psaltery player Johan de Muntpalau, and about Isabel, *la cantadera*, who was married to another male musician [5].

Like modern Muslim singers, medieval performers also might have tried to legitimize their status by performing music composed by respected male poets such as troubadours or clerics [29] [27]. One example of this attitude is recorded in stanza 183 of the *Libro de Buen Amor* in which songstresses (*cantaderas*) are described performing pieces composed by the cleric Juan Ruiz (26). In this respect, it is also easy to imagine the wife of the troubadour Gaucelm Faidit performing her husband's compositions.

As in the case of Umm Kulthoum, another way in which the medieval performers might have attempted to improve their image was to make their musical dexterity the main alluring element of their performance, keeping any feature of sensuality divorced from their figure. This seems to be represented in some depictions in which female entertainers appear to be seated, performing in the company of a male performer. These cases are all astonishing if we consider that the women represented are playing percussion instruments which—as we have seen above in the Pamplona Bible (fig. 1), the Catalan Altarpiece (fig 2), and the description of the sensual performance of the cantadera in the Libro de Buen Amor—were commonly associated with dancing and energetic physical performances [1]. Our examples are found in a modillion of the Castilian Romanesque church of San Miguel of Sotosalbos (Castile); in a capital from the cloister of the cathedral of San Pere in Vic (Catalonia); and in the illumination that accompanies Cantiga 330 from the collection of Cantigas de Santa Maria of Alfonso X contained in the El Escorial Codex j. b. 2. (figs. 5, 6, 7). It is important to notice that the female performers depicted in the first two examples play two different types of frame drums (square and round tambourines), and the woman represented in the illumination from the Cantigas plays tabella (a pair of wooden clappers). As mentioned above, both tambourines and clappers were customarily used by entertainers to accompany their simultaneous singing-dancing performances, and, therefore, in the art of the period they usually stand as a symbol for the dance [39] [40] [41] [1]. The odd thing is that the players appear to be sitting down and no dancers are represented.



Caption: Fig. 5: Seated female adufe player accompanying a standing male fiddle player, early thirteenth century. Sotosalbos (Castile), Church of San Miguel. (Photo: Juan Antonio Olañeta).



Caption: Fig. 6: *Seated female timbre (tambourine) player accompanying a male fiddle player*, fourteenth century. Vic (Catalonia), Cathedral of San Pere. (Photo: Antonella Severo).



Caption: Fig. 7: Seated female performer playing tabella accompanying a male shawm player, Cantigas de Santa Maria of Alfonso X, late thirteenth century. Biblioteca del Real Monasterio de El Escorial. Codex j. b. 2, fol. 295 v.

Thus, by sitting, a position in which their bodies were not completely displayed, and by holding musical instruments associated with dance in a non-dancing presentation, the bodies of the female performers are hidden and desexualized (27). Also, their depiction in duo with a male performer, which probably indicates their sexual and musical status under the direct tutelage of a man, further represents their compliance to the dominant precepts of medieval patriarchal society.

Finally, again, as in the case of Umm Kulthoum, female performers seemed to have tried to construct a more proper image by performing religious music. The encouragement to secular musicians to perform pious songs is encountered again in the writings of the influential theologian Peter the Chanter who in his moral treatise *Verbum abbreviatum* elevates the office of instrument players to the level of other professional activities needed by Church and state. In this effort to legitimize secular musicians he explains that among farmers, tailors, tanners, carpenters, artisans, and painters: "[the] performers of musical instruments are also necessary to alleviate tedium and sadness and to promote devotion [on people], no lascivious thoughts

[28]". As we can see here, besides advocating for a secular performance that does not promote sexual thoughts, Peter the Chanter recommends the use of appropriate religious repertoire. This recommendation seems to be exemplified in the illumination that accompanies *Cantiga 330* (fig. 7). In this depiction, taken in the context of the manuscript, our seated female performer with wooden clappers appears to be singing a *Cantiga de Santa Maria*, a paraliturgical song whose text praises the Virgin Mary either by narrating one of her miracles or by praying to her [42]. Therefore, in view of Peter the Chanter's norms, we can conclude that the woman depicted in the illumination of *Cantiga 330* can be considered a useful member of the Christian society because she is not only desexualized, but also able to perform pious music that, as in the case of a *Cantiga de Santa Maria*, will "promote devotion (29)".

Thus, as suggested by written and visual medieval sources in comparison with modern data, the medieval female performer seemed to have fought stigmatization by projecting an image of a dexterous, knowledgeable, desexualized, and pious performer. This display of ability and decorum allowed her to achieve better social mobility and tolerability. These constructed attributes probably encouraged important noble patrons, such as the ones described above, to hire them for their secular entertainment and for the performance of some sort of paraliturgical music (30).

V. Conclusion: Challenging Medieval and Current Stereotypes, Female Performers as Useful Components of Society

The acceptance of female performers in medieval society is manifested in the document composed for the creation of the Parisian Confrerie of St-Julien des Menestriers in 1321. This document, signed by male and female performers, legitimizes these music entertainers by making their profession a justifiable good in the ambit of the city [43] [4] [44] (31). This is extremely meaningful because it signifies that despite their stigmatization and minimization by clerical commentators, their performing capabilities were more important to society than their challenge to patriarchal stereotypes.

As we have seen, female performers were associated with dexterous singing and playing, with knowledge of the art of music, and with the keeping and transmitting of repertoire, all features obviously admired by their contemporaries. Taking this information into account, the tra-

ditional view of these women as mere prostitutes without musical skills, perpetuated by historiography, can now begin to be challenged. Furthermore, the construction of an image that allowed them social mobility manifests their value in the contemporaneous culture. This type of performer, like the one represented in *Cantiga 330*, desexualized, with the capability to "alleviate sadness and tedium" and able to "promote devotion [on people], no lascivious thoughts," was certainly the one envisioned by Peter the Chanter to fit into his rapidly changing Christian society.

Endnotes

- (1) By professional I refer to those who were paid to perform music. These type of entertainers received different names during the Middle Ages. Some of their most common appellatives, derived in the romance languages from the Latin noun *joculatrix* were *juglaresa*, *jotglaressa*, *jugleresse*, *jograressa*, *jonglaressa*, *jengleresse*. The appellatives *soldadeira* and *soldadera*, derived from *soldada* (money), were also used in Portuguese and Spanish respectively. For a study about these and other names given to these performers, see LORENZO ARRIBAS [5]. Since the study of these denominatives and their specific associations are beyond the scope of this paper, I will refer to these entertainers as female performers. The *rota* is a type of psaltery with strings on both sides of the resonating case. It was placed in a vertical position and played like a harp [45].
- (2) For a study of these types of records, see LORENZO ARRIBAS [5].
- (3) For a discussion about the different constraints on females during the Middle Ages, see SEGURA [4] COHEN [7]; BITEL [8]; LORENZO ARRIBAS [5] and FILIOS [9].
- (4) For the exaggerated sexualization of the female performer and some contributing factors, see FERREIRA, [48].
- (5) For the use of body movement in the performance of percussion instruments see, MOLINA [49] [50].
- (6) For different types of condemnations, see LORENZO ARRIBAS [5]; and PAGE [45].
- (7) Quidam enim cum ludibrio et turpitudine sui corporis aquirunt necessaria, et deformant ymaginem Dei [46] (Author's Translation). Similarly, the contemporary English theologian Thomas Chobham in his Summa Confessorum comments with aversion that "Some [jongleurs] distort and transfigure their bodies with scandalous jumps or gestures... and for this they are damnable unless they relinquish their office" [Quidam enim transformant et transfigurant corpora sua per turpes saltus vel per turpes gestus... et omnes tales damnabiles sunt nisi relinquant official sua [47] (Author's Translation). A final example can be taken from the Libro de las confesiones, a manual for confessors composed by Martín Pérez circa 1316. In reference to entertainers the writer explains: "There are other types of men and women that sing—without instruments—while breaking their bodies. They jump, turn around while folding their figures, and bend their eyes and mouths making despicable gestures and unappropriated villainies like those related to dirty love. [In their performances] they look as if they have broken their members, shaking them as if they have been dislocated. All these jongleurs, jongleresses, and male and female singers bear the devil's craft of promoting in men and women acts of evil love. All these performers live in great danger [Otrossí son omnes otros et mugeres que cantan sin estromentos quebrantando sus cuerpos et saltando et tornairando en doblando sus cuerpos et torciendo los ojos et las bocas et faziendo otros malos gestos et villanías de amor torpe et suzio, commo suelen algunos fazer, et semeja que an quebrantados los miembros et assí los menean commo si los oviesen descoyuntados. Todos estos joglares et joglaresas, cantadores et cantaderas, que tiene oficio del diablo para encender los omnes et mugeres en amor malo, todos son estriones et biven en grant peligro [5] (Author's Translation).
- (8) See LORENZO ARRIBAS [5].
- (9) This depiction represents a Biblical passage that narrates of how the Israelites committed the sin of fornication with the pagan Moabite women: "And Israel abode in Shit'-tim, and the people began to commit whoredom

with the daughters of Moab. And they recalled their people into sacrifices of their gods: and the people ate and bowed down to their gods" [morabatur autem eo tempore Israhel in Setthim et fornicatus est populus cum filiabus Moab quae vocaverunt eos ad sacrificia sua at illi comederunt et adoraverunt deos earum], Numbers 25:1-2.

- (10) For a history of the perception of the female performer as a mere prostitute, see LORENZO ARRIBAS [5]. For modern scholars who deem medieval performers as prostitutes with little musical ability, see MENÉNDEZ PIDAL [22] and PALLARES MÉNDEZ [51]. For commentaries about this type of historiography, see FILIOS, [9]; and SIVIERO [2].
- (11) The performance of music in intimacy or performed in "feminine" spaces seemed to have been considered more appropriate for female performers, see LORENZO ARRIBAS [5]. For a discussion of women disputing intellectual and public space and role with men, see SOLTERER [52]; and MOLINA [15].
- (12) Even though Luciana is a fictitious character and she does not appear to be performing for money like a "professional" performer, her musical skills and challenge to male-dominated space seem to be based on those of actual performers and therefore apt for this study.
- (13) Començó una laude, omne non vio atal. / Fazía fermosos sones, fermosos debaylados, /quedaua, a sabiendas, la voz a las vegadas; / fazía a la viuela dezir puntos ortados, / semeiaua que eran palabras afirmadas. I have taken the text from DOLORES CORBELLA [17]. The translation is mine. For the interpretation of debaylados as cadential melodies, see MENÉDEZ PIDAL [3].
- (14) Examples of these performance elements can be found in different treatises. For example, in the *Summa Musice*, the importance of performing rhetorically is highly emphasized in lines 2046-2065 [56]; in his *De musica* Johannes de Grocheio explains that a good fiddle player is expected to add improvised postlude melodies [45]; and, the importance of ornamenting melodic lines is stipulated in many other contemporaneous treatises such as those by Jerome of Moravia, Elias Salomonis, and Johannes de Garlandia. For a compilation of these instructions, see MCGEE [54]. Other recommended performance elements can be found in troubadour *ensenhements* such as the ones composed by Guiraut de Calasó and Guerau de Cabrera to instruct their jongleurs about how to perform in a good manner. For an edition of these texts, see FERRARI BARASSI [41] and RODRIGUEZ VELASCO [55].
- (15) Los altos e los baxos, todos d'ella dizién: / ¡La dueña e la vihuela tan bien se avinién! / Lo tenéis a fazaña cuantos que lo veyén. / Faziá otros depuertos que mucho más valién. (Author's translation).
- (16) Tu fija bien entiende huna gran partida, / á cominço bueno, es bien entendida /mas aún non se tenga por maestra complida: / sio decir quisiere, ténga por vençida. (Author's translation).
- (17) Fija, dixo el rey, ya vos l'é mandado, / seya vuestro maestro, auetlo otorgado. (Author's translation).
- (18) For the challenging role of women in the space of the master, see SOLTERER [52].
- (19) Otrosi los que son juglares, e los remedadores, e los fazedores de los çaharrones que publicamente andan por el pueblo: o cantan, o fazen juego por precio, esto es porque se enuilecen ante todos por aquel precio que les dan. Mas los que tañeren estrumentos, o cantassen por fazer solaz assi mesmos: o por fazer plazer a sus amigos: o dar solaz a los Reyes, o alos otros señores, non serian porende enfamados. The text is taken from Las siete partidas del sabio rey don Alfonso el nono, nuevamente Glosadas por el Licenciado Gregorio Lopez del Consejo Real de Indias de su Majestad. Salamanca 1555. Facsímile edition: Madrid, Boletín Oficial del Estado, 1974. (Author's translation).
- (20) In fact, sometimes the association of female performers with prostitution was so strong that the "good character" of players had to be clearly stipulated in the literature. Such a clarification is found in a text that describes a group of jongleurs and women singing songs to the accompaniment of musical instruments during the wedding of Doña Urraca and King Garcia of Navarre in 1144. Apparently to avoid a misunderstanding about the nature of these female performers, a later comment in the texts calls them "honest women" (honestae mulieres) [3].
- (21) For the original text, see PAGE [19]. This translation is taken from LEACH [56].
- (22) Herrad of Landsberg's *Hortus Deliciarum* is basically a compendium of different sciences. Unfortunately, this manuscript was destroyed during a fire in 1870 in the library of Strasbourg. The contents of the manuscript can be reconstructed thanks to copies of the images made during 1818 by Christian Moritz Engelhardt and the texts

- copied by Straub and Keller between 1879 and 1899. For an edition of this manuscript with the copied illuminations and texts, see GREEN, Rosalie [57]; Michael Evans, Christine Bischoff, and Michael Curschmann. 1979. The Hortus Deliciarum of Herrad of Hohenbourg (Landsberg, 1176-96): A Reconstruction. Warburg Institute/ E.J. Brill. The depiction of the female performers singing, and playing flute and harp seemed to be based on Isidoro of Seville's text from chapter XI: 30 of his Etymologiarum in which he explains that the sirens: quarum una voce, altera tibias, tertia lyra canebant (one sung with her voice, another played a tibia, and a third one a lyra).
- (23) Sirens are usually depicted nude. It seems that the representation of their naked breasts identify them as prostitutes by depicting immodesty. For studies about the representations of sirens during the Middle Ages see LEACH [19]; PÉREZ SESCUN [18]; and LORENZO ARRIBAS [20].
- (24) For essays on this subject, see DE LOPE [58].
- (25) Desque la cantadera dize el cantar primero, / siempre los pies le bullen e mal para el pandero. / Texedor e cantadera nunca tienen los pies quedos, / en el telar e en la dança siempre bullen los dedos; / la muger sin vergüenza, por darle diez Toledos, / no dexarié de fazer sus antojos azedos. For a study and commentaries of this text, see BLECUA [59]. (Author's translation).
- (26) Thereafter, I composed many dance songs / for Jewish and Moorish women and for knowledgeable females, / so in those instruments, in the most common way: / the song that you don't know, learn it from a songstresses" [Después fiz muchas cantigas, de dança e troteras, / para judías e moras e para entendederas, / para en instrumentos de comunales maneras, / el cantar que no sabes, oilo a cantaderas], staza1513. The text is taken from BLECUA [59]. (Author's translation)
- (27) Dance performances seem to have been one of the most problematic features of female performers. This is why in his Summa de sacramentis Peter the Chanter criticizes body movement preferring instrumental performance. As we have seen above, the theologian explains that those who "...earn a living through the immoral and obscene use of their bodies, in this way deforming the image of God", should be outcast. But then he proclaims that if on the other hand: "they, [secular performers] play musical instruments, or sing heroic songs to recreate or to instruct, [they] are prompt to be excused [Sed si cantent cum instrumentis, uel cantent de gestis rebus ad recreationem uel forte ad informationem, uicini sunt excusationi. DUGAUQUIER[46].
- (28) ... artifices etiam instrumentorum musicorum, ut eis tristitia et taedium amoveatur, devotio non lascivia excitetur. Peter the Chanter, Verbum abbreviatum PL 205, col 253, ed. J. P. Migne, Patrologia Latina 205, cols. 9-528. Peter's position was followed by many other theologians of the period including Thomas of Chobham, Robert of Courson, Evrard du Val-des-Ecoliers, Alexander of Hales, and Thomas Docking [43].
- (29) For a study of the construction of the jongleur as a useful member of the Christian state, see PAGE [43].
- (30) Probably, as in the case of the Rom performers, patrons value great performances encouraging their presence in appropriate settings SILVERMAN [12].
- (31) The female names included are: Isabelet la Rousselle, Marcella Chartaine, Liégart, femme Bienveignant, Marguerite, la femme au Moyne, Jehane le Ferpière, Allison, femme Guillot Guérin, Adeline, femme G., l'anglois, Isabiau la Lorraine.

Bibliography

- [1] MOLINA, Mauricio Frame Drums in the Medieval Iberian Peninsula. Reichenberger, Kassel, 2010
- [2] SIVIERO, Donatella "Mujeres y jugraría en la edad media hispánica: algunos aspectos". *Medievalia* 15, 2012,147-142.
- [3] MENÉNDEZ PIDAL, Gonzalo La España del siglo XIII leída en imágenes. Real Academia de la Historia, Madrid, 1986.

- [4] SEGURA, Cristina Mujeres públicas/malas mujeres: Mujeres honradas/mujeres privadas. In Árabes, judías y cristianas: Mujeres en la Europa medieval, ed. Cristina del Moral. Universidad de Granada, Granada, 1993, 53-62.
- [5] LORENZO ARRIBAS, Josemi. Las mujeres y la música en la Edad Media europea: relaciones y significados. Ph.D. diss., Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Madrid, 2003.
- [6] FUENTE, María Jesús Velos y Desvelos: cristianas, musulmanas, y judías en la España medieval. La Esfera de los Libros, Madrid, 2006.
- [7] COHEN, Judith R. Ca no soe joglaresa: Women and Music in Medieval Spain's Three Cultures. In Medieval Woman's Song: Cross-Cultural Approaches, ed. Anne L. Klinck and Ann Marie Rasmussen, 66-80. University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, 2002, 6-80.
- [8] BITEL, Lisa M Women in Early Medieval Europe 400-1100. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2002.
- [9] FILIOS, Denise K. Performing Women in the Middle Ages: Sex, Gender, and the Iberian Lyric. Palgrave Macmillan, New York, 2005.
- [10] GRAHAM-BROWN, Sarah Images of Women, The portrayal of Women in Photography of the Middle East 1860-1950. Columbia University Press, New York, 1988.
- [11] DOUBLEDAY, Veronica The Frame Drum in the Middle East: Women, Musical Instruments and Power. Ethnomusicology 43, 1999,109.
- [12] SILVERMAN, Carol "The Gender of the Profession: Music, Dance, and Reputation among Balkan Muslim Rom Women." In *Music and Gender: Perspectives from the Mediterranean*, ed. Tullia Magrini, 119-145. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 2003, 119-145.
- [13] CORRAL DÍAZ, Ester As mulleres nas cantigas medievais, Publicacións do Seminario de Estudos Galegos, A Coruña, 1996.
- [14] MAZO KARRAS, Ruth Common Women: Prostitution and Sexuality in Medieval England. Oxford University Press, New York, 1996.
- [15] MOLINA, Mauricio Non se tenga por maestra complida: The Skillful Medieval Female Performer and her Challenge to the Social and Intellectual Space Dominated by Males.In Recent Research in Early Iberian Music in an International Context (Papers from the Medieval and Renaissance Music Conference, Barcelona, 5-8 July 2011). Reichenberger, Kassel, 2014.

- [16] DEVOTO, DANIEL 1972. Dos notas sobre el libro de Apolonio. Bolletin Hispanique 74, 1972, 291-330.
- [17] CORBELLA, Dolores (ed.) Libro de Apolonio. Catedra, Madrid, 1999.
- [18] PÉREZ SUESCUN, Fernando, and RODRÍGUEZ LÓPEZ, María Victoria Las sirenas medievales: aproximación literaria e iconogáfica. Anales de Historia del Arte 7, 1997, 55-66.
- [19] LEACH, Elizabeth Eva 'The little pipe sings sweetly while the fowler deceives the bird': sirens in the later Middle Ages. Music & Letters 87, 2006, 187-211.
- [20] LORENZO ARRIBAS, Josemi. El canto que encanta. Las sirenas en la tradición hispana antigua y medieval. Mirabilia 7, 2007, 39-58.
- [21] METZGER, Therese, and METZGER, Mendel. Jewish Life in the Middle Ages: Illuminated Hebrew Manuscripts of the Thirteenth to the Sixteenth Centuries. New York, Alpine Fine Arts Collection, 1982.
- [22] MENÉNDEZ PIDAL, Ramón Poesía juglaresca y juglares: Orígenes de las literaturas románicas. Espasa Calpe, Madrid, 1962.
- [23] MARSAN, Rameline E. Itinéraire espagnol du conte médiéval (VIIIe –XVe siècles). Librairie C. Klincksieck, Paris, 1974.
- [24] COHEN, Judith R. Le Rôle des Femmes-Musiciennes dans l'Espagne Médiévale dans les Communautés Chrétienne, Juive et Musulmane. Master's thesis, Université de Montréal, Montréal, 1980.
- [25] GÓMEZ MUNTANÉ, Maricarmen La música en la casa real catalano-aragonesa, 1336-1432. Bosch, Barcelona, 1979.
- [26] CHABANEAU, Camille Les biographies des trobadours en la lange provençale. Vol. 10. Toulouse, 1885. Slatkine Reprints, Genève, 1975.
- [27] BOYTON, Susan Women's Performance of the Lyric Before 1500. In Medieval Woman's Song, Cross-Cultural Approaches, ed. Anne L. Klinck and Ann Marie Rasmussen, 47-65. University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, 2002, 47-65.
- [28] FERREIRA, Manuel Pedro. Cantus Coronatus: 7 Cantigas d'El-Rei Dom Dinis. Reichenberger, Kassel, 2005.
- [29] PLUMMER, John F. The Woman's Song in Middle English. In Vox Feminae: Studies in Medieval Woman's Song, ed. John F. Plummer. Medieval Institute Publications, Kalamazoo, 1981.

- [39] VARELA de VEGA, Juan Bautista Anotaciones históricas sobre las tejoletas y los palillos castellanos. Revista de folklore 2, 1981, 15-21.
- [40] VEIGA de OLIVEIRA, Ernesto *Instrumentos Musicais Populares Portugueses*. Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, Lisboa, 1982.
- [41] FERRARI Barassi, Elena Strumenti musicali ed esecutori nella società medievale. Benucci, Perugia, 1983.
- [42] CUNNINGHAM, Martin G. Alfonso X el Sabio: Cantigas de Loor. University College Dublin Press, Dublin, 2002.
- [43] PAGE, Christopher The Owl and the Nightingale: Musical Life and Ideas in France, 1100-1300. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1990.
- [44] SLOCUM, Kay Brainerd "Confrérie, Bruderschaft" and Guild: The Formation of Musicians' Fraternal Organisations in Thirteenth- and Fourteenth-Century Europe. Early Music History 14, 1995, 257-273.
- [45] PAGE, Christopher Voices and Instruments of the Middle Ages. University of California Press, Berkley, 1986.
- [46] DUGAUQUIER, J. A. (ed.) Pierre le Chantre Summa de sacramentis et animae consiliis. Louvain: Nauwelaerts, Louvain, 1954-67, III 2a.
- [47] BROOMFIELD, F. (ed.), Thomae de Chobham Summa Confessorum. Nauwelaerts, Louvain, 1968.
- [48] FERREIRA, Ana Paula A 'Outra Arte' das Soldadeiras. Luzo-Brazilian Review 30, 1993,155-166.
- [49] MOLINA, Mauricio Frame Drums in the Medieval Iberian Peninsula. Reichenberger, Kassel, 2010
- [50] MOLINA, Mauricio Tympanista nostra: la reconstrucción del contexto y la práctica musical de las pandereteras y aduferas medievales a través de sus representaciones en el arte románico español. *Codex Aquilarensis* 26, 2010, 77-104.
- [51] PALLARES MÉNDEZ, M. C. A vida das mulleres na Galicia medieval (1100-1500), Universidade de Santiago de Compostela, Santiago de Compostela, 1993.

- [52] SOLTERER, Helen The Master and Minerva: Disputing Women in French Medieval Culture. University of California Press, Berkeley, 1995.
- [53] PAGE, Christopher (ed.) Summa Musice: A Thirteenth-century Manual for Singers. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1991.
- [54] MCGEE, Timothy J. The Sound of the Medieval Son: Ornamentation and Vocal Style According to the treatises. Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1990.
- [55] RODRÍGUEZ VELASCO, Jesús D. Castigo para celosos, consejos para juglares. Gredos, Madrid, 1999.
- [56] PAGE, Christopher A Treatise on Musicians from c.1400: The Tractatulus de differentiis et gradibus cantorum. Journal of the Royal Musical Association 117, 1992, 1–21.
- [57] GREEN, Rosalie; Michael Evans, Christine Bischoff, and Michael Curschmann (eds.). *The Hortus Deliciarum of Herrad of Hohenbourg (Landsberg, 1176-96): A Reconstruction.* Warburg Institute/ E.J. Brill. 1979.
- [58] DE LOPE, Monique Traditions populaires et textualité dans le "Libro de Buen Amor." Centre d'Études et de Recherches Sociocritiques, Montpellier, 1984.
- [59] BLECUA, Alberto (ed.) Libro de buen amor. Cátedra, Madrid, 1996.
- [60] BASKIN, Judith. Jewish Women in the Middle Ages. In Jewish Women in Historical Perspective, ed. J. Baskin. Wayne State Univ. Press, Detroit, 1991, 94-114.
- [61] CORRAL DÍAZ, Ester As mulleres nas cantigas medievais, Publicacións do Seminario de Estudos Galegos, A Coruña, 1996.
- [62] CORTÉS GARCÍA, Manuela La mujer y la música en la sociedad arabomusulmana y su proyección en la cristiana medieval. Música oral del sur 2, 1986,193-206.
- [63] CORTÉS GARCÍA, Manuela La música en la Zaragoza islámica. Instituto de Estudios Islámicos y del Oriente Próximo, Zaragoza, 2009.
- [64] JOSET, Jacques (ed.) Libro de buen amor. Taurus, Madrid, 1990.
- [65] LIU, Benjamin M., and MONROE, James T Ten Hispano-Arabic Strophic Songs in the Modern Oral Tradition, Music and Texts. University of California Press, Berkeley, 1989.

- [66] PAGE, Christopher Jerome of Moravia on the Rubeba and Viella. The Galpin Society Journal 32, 1979, 77-98.
- [67] PETER the CHANTER Verbum abbreviatum. Patrologia Latina 205, cols. 9-528.
- [68] SHILOAH, Amnon The Theory of Music in Arabic Writings (c. 900-1900): Descriptive Catalogue of Manuscripts in Libraries of Europe and the U.S.A., RISM B/Xa. Henle Verlag, Munich, 1979.

